

Minutes
Huron-Clinton Metropolitan Authority
Board of Commissioners
Thursday, October 14, 2021

A regular meeting of the Huron-Clinton Metropolitan Authority's Board of Commissioners was held on Thursday, October 14, 2021. Due to state of Michigan Department of Health and Human Services Emergency Order under MCL 333.2253 and to minimize the spread of COVID-19, this meeting was held in person and electronically, as permitted under Public Act 228 of 2020.

Commissioners Present:	Jaye Quadrozzi Bernard Parker Robert W. Marans Tiffany Taylor John Paul Rea Stephen Pontoni Bill Bolin
------------------------	--

Staff Officers Present:	
Director	Amy McMillan
Deputy Director	Michael Lyons
Chief of Finance	Shedreka Miller

Others:	
Miller, Canfield, Paddock & Stone	Steve Mann

1. Call to Order

Commissioner Quadrozzi called the meeting to order at 1:05 p.m.

2. Chairperson's Statement

Commissioner Quadrozzi everyone welcomed everyone to Kensington.

3. Public Participation

Toni Spears, Dexter, MI, updated new Board members on her background and referenced a letter sent to the Board regarding botanical species and invasive species growth at the Metroparks and inquired about the deer management plan for Dexter-Huron Metropark.

4. Approval – September 9, 2021 Regular Meeting Minutes

Motion by Commissioner Rea, support from Commissioner Marans that the Board of Commissioners approve the September 9, 2021 meeting minutes as submitted.

Motion carried unanimously.

5. Approval – October 14, 2021 Full Agenda

Motion by Commissioner Marans, support from Commissioner Rea that the Board of Commissioners approve the October 14, 2021 full agenda as presented.

Motion carried unanimously.

6. Approval – October 14, 2021 Consent Agenda

Motion by Commissioner Rea, support from Commissioner Parker that the Board of Commissioners approve the October 14, 2021 consent agenda as presented:

- a. Approval – September 2021 Financial Statements
- b. Approval – September 2021 Appropriation Adjustments
- c. Report – Monthly 2021 Capital Project Fund Update
- d. Report – Monthly 2021 Major Maintenance Update
- e. Report – Purchases over \$10,000
- f. Purchases
 1. Total Spend and Vendor Location
 2. Upfitting Police Vehicles

Motion carried unanimously.

7. Reports

A. Planning & Fund Development Department

1. Report – Permit Scanning Data Analysis

Motion by Commissioner Rea, support from Commissioner Parker that the Board of Commissioners receive and file the August/September Visitation Report as recommended by the Chief of Planning and Development Nina Kelly and staff.

Discussion: Chief of Planning and Development Nina Kelly updated the Board on scanning activity in the Metroparks, reviewed data caveats and the overall scanning rate throughout the system. She reviewed the DTE free weekends and said 64,430 daily passes were redeemed (annual passes were not scanned). Harrison Township had the highest zip rate of codes scanned this period while the city of Detroit had a decrease in scans.

Commissioner Quadrozzi asked if there is an analysis on daily scans on DTE weekend versus non-DTE weekends. Ms. Kelly said the information can be pulled out of the data.

Commissioner Marans asked if staff could pull data to see what households are visiting multiple parks in a reporting period. Ms. Kelly said yes, it could be done.

Commissioner Quadrozzi expressed her appreciation to Ms. Kelly and all the hard work she has done for the Metroparks and wished her well in her new endeavor.

Motion carried unanimously.

2. Approval – 2021 Stony Creek Master Plan Update

Motion by Commissioner Rea, support from Commissioner Bolin that the Board of Commissioners approve the 2021 update to the Stony Creek Master Plan as recommended by Chief of Planning and Development Nina Kelly and staff.

Discussion: Chief of Planning and Development Nina Kelly updated the Board and reviewed the process, community engagement and the updated components to the plan as well as the action plan.

Commissioner Parker asked if there were any improvements to the golf course. Ms. Kelly said not in this updated plan.

Motion carried unanimously.

3. Approval – Five-Year Community Recreation Plan Survey Consultant

Motion by Commissioner Rea, support from Commissioner Bolin that the Board of Commissioners approve accept the proposal from ETC Institute in the amount of \$72,500 to conduct a public survey of the Metroparks service area as recommended by Chief of Planning and Development Nina Kelly and staff.

Discussion: Chief of Planning and Development Nina Kelly introduced Jason Morado with the ETC Institute. He explained the process that would be used to conduct the survey.

Commissioner Pontoni asked how mobile phone numbers would be obtained. Mr. Morado said ETC uses a brokerage firm.

Commissioner Marans asked how ETC will involve Board members. Mr. Morado said the Board would work with staff to develop the survey.

Commissioner Marans asked what ETC expects the response rates to be. Mr. Morado said 12-15 percent.

Commissioner Marans asked if they would be using any incentives. Mr. Morado said no.

Commissioner Marans asked if the data would be made available to staff. Mr. Morado said yes.

Commissioner Taylor asked if the 12-15 percent response rate was normal for ETC. Mr. Morado said yes.

Commissioner Parker asked if the response rate would be lower because it's taking place in November/December? Mr. Morado said it's a slower response rate.

Commissioner Parker said they may get more responses if it was done at time of year when people were out and using the parks.

Director McMillan said the Board could set up a subcommittee to work on the survey.

Commissioner Rea said it was timely to have a consultant to move the recreation plan forward.

Ms. McMillan said some of the Metroparks partners were also updating their five-year plans and that they have discussed having joint questions.

Commissioner Parker asked how input from the Board would work.

Commissioner Quadrozzi said she would support a subcommittee with Commissioner Marans as the lead.

Commissioner Rea said he would participate as well.

Motion carried unanimously.

7. Reports

B. Financial Department

1. Report – Monthly Financial Review

Motion by Commissioner Parker, support from Commissioner Marans that the Board of Commissioners receive and file the monthly financial review as presented by Chief of Finance Shedreka Miller and staff.

Discussion: Chief of Finance Shedreka Miller updated the Board on revenue and expenditures for September.

Motion carried unanimously.

2. Approval – Appointment of New Retirement Plan Trustee

Motion by Commissioner Parker, support from Commissioner Marans that the Board of Commissioners appoint Shedreka Miller as Plan Trustee for the Huron-Clinton Metropolitan Authority Employees' Retirement Plan effective October 14, 2021 as recommended by Director Amy McMillan and staff.

Motion carried unanimously.

3. Approval – Appointment of Retiree Health Care Trust Plan Administrator

Motion by Commissioner Parker, support from Commissioner Marans that the Board of Commissioners appoint Shedreka Miller as Retiree Health Care Trust Administrator as recommended by Director Amy McMillan and staff.

Motion carried unanimously.

C. Departmental Updates

1. Report – Marketing Update

Motion by Commissioner Rea, support from Commissioner Bolin that the Board of Commissioners receive and file monthly marketing update as recommended by Chief of Marketing and Communications Danielle Mauter and staff.

Discussion: Chief of Marketing and Communications Danielle Mauter updated the Board on the website redesign and when 2022 annual permits would go on sale to the public.

Motion carried unanimously.

7. Reports

C. Departmental Updates

2. Report – Natural Resources Update

Motion by Commissioner Rea, support from Commissioner Taylor that the Board of Commissioners receive and file the Natural Resources update as recommended by Chief of Natural Resources and Regulatory Compliance Tyler Mitchell and staff.

Discussion: Chief of Natural Resources and Regulatory Compliance Tyler Mitchell updated the Board on projects and highlighted activities in the Natural Resources department that took place during the month highlighting various types of shorelines throughout the Metroparks.

Motion carried unanimously.

3. Report – DEI Update

Motion by Commissioner Rea, support from Commissioner Taylor that the Board of Commissioners receive and file monthly DEI update as recommended by Chief of Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Artina Carter and staff.

Discussion: Chief of Chief of Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Artina Carter updated the Board on DEI efforts highlighting Natural Sciences Career Pathways. She also said a climate survey would be launched for employees soon.

Commissioner Taylor said she appreciates the cross-departmental work.

Motion carried unanimously.

4. Report – Planning Department Monthly Update

Motion by Commissioner Parker, support from Commissioner Rea that the Board of Commissioners receive and file the Planning and Development Department Monthly Update as recommended by Chief of Planning and Development Nina Kelly and staff.

Discussion: Director McMillan updated the Board on behalf of Chief of Planning and Development Nina Kelly. She also said Jason Bibby would be the interim chief of planning and development and that Ms. Kelly would be working as a consultant to help finish projects.

Motion carried unanimously.

5. Report – Interpretive Services Update

Motion by Commissioner Rea, support from Commissioner Taylor that the Board of Commissioners receive and file Interpretive Services monthly update as recommended by Chief of Interpretive Services Jennifer Jaworski and staff.

Discussion: Chief of Interpretive Services Jennifer Jaworski updated the Board on various programs and initiatives that took place during the month and said there were 490 checkouts with the Library Pass program with 222 redeemed.

Commissioner Quadrozzi asked for a blurb about programming as it relates to the overall price for park passes.

Commissioner Taylor asked to see a list of schools and map where the Metroparks conducts programming.

Motion carried unanimously.

D. Natural Resources Department

1. Bids – Material for Shoreline Restoration, Lake Erie and Lake St. Clair Metroparks

Motion by Commissioner Parker, support from Commissioner Marans that the Board of Commissioners award ITB 2021-043 for material for shoreline restoration in the amount of \$28,150.84 to Hanes Geo Components of Livonia, Michigan, the low responsive,

responsible bidder for ITB 2021-043 as recommended by Chief of Natural Resources and Regulatory Compliance Tyler Mitchell and staff.

Discussion: Chief of Natural Resources and Regulatory Compliance Tyler Mitchell updated the Board on the project and said the work includes providing and delivering material for shoreline restoration to Lake Erie and Lake St. Clair Metroparks.

Motion carried unanimously.

7. Reports

D. Natural Resources Department

2. Bids – Beach Spoils Pile Removal, Lake St. Clair Metropark

Motion by Commissioner Taylor, support from Commissioner Taylor that the Board of Commissioners award ITB 2021-042 for the removal of beach spoils for a not-to-exceed amount of \$50,000 to Santoro Services, LLC of New Baltimore, Michigan, the low responsive, responsible bidder for ITB 2021-042 as recommended by Chief of Natural Resources and Regulatory Compliance Tyler Mitchell and staff.

Discussion: Chief of Natural Resources and Regulatory Compliance Tyler Mitchell updated the Board on the project.

Commissioner Rea said it's a pretty substantial spread for the cost. Mr. Tyler said staff did their due diligence regarding the vendor and that they did supply references.

Motion carried unanimously.

3. Bids – Shoreline Restoration, Lake Erie Metropark

Motion by Commissioner Taylor, support from Commissioner Rea that the Board of Commissioners award a contract for Lake Erie Shoreline Restoration to Catskill Remedial Contracting Services Inc. of Brighton, Michigan, the low responsive, responsible bidder for a not-to-exceed amount of \$101,475, which includes \$51,475 for the base work and a contingency of \$50,000 for other work that, at the Metroparks sole option, needs to be completed to obtain optimal results as recommended by Chief of Natural Resources and Regulatory Compliance Tyler Mitchell and staff.

Discussion: Mr. Tyler updated the Board and said GLC and NOAA have provided funding to support the Metroparks efforts to increase coastal resiliency and biological diversity through the restoration of shoreline and Great Lakes coastal marshlands. In 2019, with support from GLC and NOAA, the Metroparks contracted with GEI Consultants to oversee design, construction, pre- and post-monitoring, and coordinate restoration of the shoreline and marshlands at Lake Erie Metropark. Since then, GEI Consultants, the Metroparks and a Technical Advisory Team consisting of members from partner organizations GLC and NOAA, have detailed two major projects to benefit Lake Erie, one of which is the restoration of Lake Erie Metropark's shoreline.

Commissioner Pontoni asked why the bids did not include the DEI component. Ms. McMillan said they do, and that it is listed on the total spend document in the consent agenda.

Motion carried unanimously.

E. Engineering Department

1. Bids – Pool Plaza Concrete Repairs, Lake Erie

Motion by Commissioner Marans, support from Commissioner Rea that the Board of Commissioners (1) award Contract 712-21-136 to the low responsive, responsible bidder, Universal Consolidated Enterprises, Inc., in the amount of \$61,474; and (2) approve the transfer of \$1,474 from the Lake Erie unallocated account to cover the cost of the project as recommended by Chief of Engineering Services Mike Henkel and staff.

Discussion: Deputy Director Mike Lyons updated the Board and said the concrete surface on the plaza by the wave pool has deteriorated and needs to be replaced and that the work includes up to 517 square yards of concrete removal and replacement.

Commissioner Pontoni asked if the bidder included a DEI plan. Mr. Lyons said no, it was a straight rate.

Commissioner Pontoni vote no.

Motion carried.

7. Reports

E. Engineering Department

2. Bids – Roadway Repairs, Lake Erie Metropark

Motion by Commissioner Rea, support from Commissioner Marans that the Board of Commissioners award Contract 712-21-138 to the low responsive, responsible bidder, Best Asphalt, Inc. in the amount of \$22,960 as recommended by Chief of Engineering Services Mike Henkel and staff.

Discussion: Deputy Director Mike Lyons updated the Board and said a sink hole developed in the main park roadway necessitating the repair. It is believed that it may be the location of an old culvert. The original project was scoped with a culvert replacement; however, after further investigation no culvert is needed. There is currently a temporary steel plate over the depression. He said the work includes repairing and paving of approximately 200 square yards of roadway and installing 89 square yards of heavy rip rap.

Motion carried unanimously.

3. Bids – Kensington Farm Septic Tank Replacement, Kensington

Motion by Commissioner Marans, support from Commissioner Rea that the Board of Commissioners (1) award Contract 704-21-373 to the low responsive, responsible bidder, Bob Myers Excavating, Inc. in the amount of \$45,450; and (2) transfer funds from the Lower Huron unallocated account to cover the cost of the project as recommended by Chief of Engineering Services Mike Henkel and staff.

Discussion: Deputy Director Mike Lyons updated the Board and said the Kensington Farm Center's septage is handled by a tile field system that includes six septic tanks in series. The first and second 1,000-gallon tanks were replaced last year. Four of the remaining tanks need to be replaced due to the deterioration of the concrete. The four, 1000-gallon tanks will be replaced with three 1500-gallon tanks. The expectation was to get a few more years of service from the existing tanks but it's necessary to replace them at this time.

Motion carried unanimously.

4. Bids – Turtle Cove Crosswalk Path, Lower Huron

Motion by Commissioner Bolin, support from Commissioner Pontoni that the Board of Commissioners award Contract No. 506-21-498 to the low responsive, responsible bidder, Best Asphalt, Inc. in the amount of \$81,352.50 as recommended by Chief of Engineering Services Mike Henkel and staff.

Discussion: Deputy Director Mike Lyons updated the Board and said the proposed path will accommodate the many park patrons that use the Foxwoods parking lot to access Turtle Cove and the surrounding greenspace. Currently there is no path or crossing. The path will provide a centralized point to cross the road, aid in traversing the ditch line, and increase safety for pedestrians.

Motion carried unanimously.

7. Reports

E. Engineering Department

5. Approval – Change Order, Willow Park Office

Motion by Commissioner Marans, support from Commissioner Rea that the Board of Commissioners approve a change order for the construction of the new Willow Park Office contract 510-17-311 in the amount of \$36,369.71 to cover additional construction costs as recommended by Chief of Engineering Services Mike Henkel and staff.

Discussion: Deputy Director Mike Lyons updated the Board and said funding is currently available in the Capital Projects Fund to cover the additional costs from other under budget projects.

Commissioner Marans asked what the schedule was to complete the project. Mr. Lyons said staff was hoping to have the project completed by the end of the year with move-in sometime next year.

Commissioner Taylor said she would like to know how many contractors submit at DEI plan.

Motion carried unanimously.

8. Leadership Update

a. Wildlife Management Plan

Ms. McMillan said updates to the wildlife management plan was in progress and it would be brought to the Board in December.

b. Wages

Ms. McMillan updated the Board on questions related to requested information stemming from the September 2021 Board meeting and that the information provided to commissioners include seasonal and provisional employees. She said it is important to note that all full-time employees at the Metroparks currently make \$15 or more per hour and the information you received is specific to seasonal and provisional employees. Ms. McMillan said the numbers reflect actual hours worked versus budgeted hours and the data is broken down by seasonal and provisional employees.

Ms. McMillan said without any wage compression, the cost for provisional employees (1500 hours per year) would be approximately \$516,000 per year. For Seasonal employees (600 hours per year) and with no wage compression, the cost would be approximately \$900,000 to \$1.2 million per year. With wage compression it would be approximately \$3 million or more a year.

Commissioner Pontoni asked how wage compression works. Chief of Finance Shedreka Miller said it's done by comparing pay rates. For example, if you increased the lowest level pay rate by \$10 and increase using the same percentage rate.

Commissioner Parker asked whether this matter was totally discussion today or whether the Board was ready to take some action.

Motion by Commissioner Parker that seasonal and provisional employees go up to \$15 an hour without compression.

Commissioner Quadrozzi asked if there was support.

Commissioner Taylor asked for clarification as to whether the motion was just for discussion or for action.

Commissioner Parker stated the motion was for action and then discussion.

Commissioner Parker said he believes wages need to go up to \$15 per hour for survival and for diversity because people aren't coming to the Metroparks to work for \$10 an hour and that one of the main reasons we don't have a diversified workforces is because of low wages.

Commissioner Taylor thanked staff for providing the information. She said she is in favor of a \$15 minimum wage but would like to fully understand the ramifications of wage compression.

Commissioner Rea thanked staff for the information and said he was going to echo Commissioner Taylor's remarks and that he believes there is merit to for raising wages but the Board needs to know the issues related to wage compression and there have to be other ways the Metroparks can use to attract employees. As an organization, the Board needs to be stewards of the public and the Board needs to explore sustainability options.

Commissioner Bolin said he opposes a \$15 minimum wage and that the Metroparks cannot keep up with the private sector.

Commissioner Marans said he would like to see the data and what HR has. Also, how are the applications for minorities affected by the wage scale.

Commissioner Rea also suggested talking to other parks and recreation and public agencies for information.

Commissioner Pontoni said he supports Commissioner Parker's motion but said he had questions related to wage compression. He said the Board did not need to take action today and that he would support a motion to table the discussion until there was a chance to review all the information and to make sure everyone is on board.

Commissioner Taylor said she was also in support but would like to table the item.

Commissioner Marans said he would like to see other agencies data and what their plans were.

Commissioner Quadrozzi said as she understands things now, there is Commissioner Parker's motion and that it was supported.

Commissioner Parker said it was not supported.

Commissioner Quadrozzi said she thought Commissioner Pontoni supported the motion.

Commissioner Pontoni said he supports Commissioner Parkers Motion but also wants to table the item.

Commissioner Quadrozzi said she was going to suggest tabling the motion based on the slightly modified support.

Commissioner Bolin raised a point of order and said if the Board calling parliamentary law, that would be a clear violation to proceed with a vote. If it is going to be tabled it needs to be taken off by Commissioner Parker.

Commissioner Quadrozzi asked Commissioner Parker if he wanted to proceed on his motion or pull it.

Commissioner Parker said he was OK with passing it for today and that tabling it was another situation.

Commissioner Quadrozzi and Director McMillan asked legal counsel for clarification on the status of the motion.

Attorney Mann said he thinks initially the motion didn't have support and then discussion ensued; so, the motion died. There was further discussion and there was later support. If the Board wants to vote on something there should be a new motion and support and then vote on whatever the motion is. He said tabling was not the correct term and that you could entertain a motion to postpone. Or the Board could do nothing and wait for the Director to bring back additional information at which time it would show up [at a future meeting].

Commissioner Bolin asked if it would be appropriate to retract the motion in order to put it into suspense.

Commissioner Parker said again that he recognized there was not a second to the motion.

Attorney Mann confirmed that the motion had died.

Commissioner Bolin said the only issue he has with that is the Board had discussions, which shouldn't have taken place.

Attorney Mann said that Robert's Rules of Order provides small assemblies the ability for informal discussion.

Commissioner Bolin said he interpreted it differently.

Commissioner Quadrozzi said she believes the support was withdrawn so it no longer mattered.

Commissioner Parker said the wage item needs to be discussed before approving the 2022 budget in December.

Commissioner Marans asked if the motion was for provisional or seasonal employees. Ms. McMillan said provisional employees. She also said staff will set aside \$350,000 in the 2022 budget so it will be there for discussion purposes.

Commissioner Bolin asked if the seasonal bonus was because the Metroparks couldn't hire people. Ms. McMillan said yes and no.

Commissioner Bolin asked if there has been any discussion on adding educational bonuses. Ms. McMillan said no.

9. Other Business

None.

10. Public Participation

None.

11. Commissioner Comments

None.

12. Motion to Adjourn

Motion by Commissioner Rea, support from Commissioner Parker that the Board of Commissioners adjourn the regular meeting.

The meeting adjourned at 3:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Shawn M. Athayde
Recording Secretary